

**UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

SECURITIES INVESTOR PROTECTION
CORPORATION,

Plaintiff-Applicant,

v.

BERNARD L. MADOFF INVESTMENT
SECURITIES LLC,

Defendant.

No. 08-01789 (SMB)
SIPA LIQUIDATION
(Substantively Consolidated)

In re:

BERNARD L. MADOFF INVESTMENT
SECURITIES LLC,

Debtor.

Applicable to the Adversary Proceedings
Listed on Exhibit A

**SO ORDERED STIPULATION
APPLYING OMNIBUS EXTRATERRITORIALITY BRIEFING
AND MEMORANDUM DECISION TO CERTAIN JOINDER DEFENDANTS**

Irving H. Picard (the “Trustee”), as trustee of the substantively consolidated liquidation proceeding of Bernard L. Madoff Investment Securities LLC (“BLMIS”), under the Securities Investor Protection Act (“SIPA”), 15 U.S.C. §§ 78aaa *et seq.*, and the estate of Bernard L. Madoff, individually, and the defendants identified in Exhibit A hereto (the “Joinder Defendants”), by and through their respective undersigned counsel (collectively, the “Parties”), state as follows:

WHEREAS, on May 15, 2012 and June 7, 2012, respectively, the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, the Honorable Jed S. Rakoff, entered Orders in which he withdrew the reference in certain adversary proceedings pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 157(d) to determine whether SIPA and/or the Bankruptcy Code as incorporated by SIPA apply extraterritorially, permitting the Trustee to avoid initial transfers that were received abroad or to recover from initial, immediate, or mediate foreign transferees (the “Extraterritoriality Issue”). *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, No. 12-mc-0115 (JSR), ECF Nos. 97, 167, and 203;

WHEREAS, the Joinder Defendants did not move to withdraw the reference as to the Extraterritoriality Issue and/or did not participate in the briefing or oral argument on the Extraterritoriality Issue before Judge Rakoff;

WHEREAS, after consolidated briefing and oral argument on the Extraterritoriality Issue, *see id.*, ECF Nos. 234, 309, 310, 322, and 357, on July 7, 2014, Judge Rakoff entered an Opinion and Order (the “Extraterritoriality Order”) and returned the withdrawn adversary proceedings to the Bankruptcy Court for further proceedings consistent with the Extraterritoriality Order. *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, 513 B.R. 222 (S.D.N.Y. 2014);

WHEREAS, on July 28, 2014, Judge Rakoff entered a Stipulation and Supplemental Opinion and Order in which he supplemented the Extraterritoriality Order to direct that certain additional adversary proceedings should “also be returned to the Bankruptcy Court for further proceedings consistent with” the Extraterritoriality Order. *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, No. 12-mc-0115 (JSR), ECF No. 556;

WHEREAS, after the adversary proceedings were returned to this Court, the parties stipulated to a scheduling order (the “Scheduling Order”), attaching certain exhibits listing those defendants that were parties to the proceedings before Judge Rakoff and to the Extraterritoriality Order (the “Participating Defendants”), as well as those defendants who were not parties to the Extraterritoriality Order but contended that they were similarly situated (the “Non-Participating Defendants” and collectively with the Participating Defendants the “Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants”). *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, Adv. Pro. No. 08-01789 (SMB), ECF No. 8800;

WHEREAS, the Scheduling Order included certain stipulations relating to the place of formation or citizenship of the subsequent transferors and subsequent transferees comprising the Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants;

WHEREAS, the Joinder Defendants were not Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants and did not participate in the briefing or oral argument on the Extraterritoriality Issue before Judge Bernstein (the “Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss”);

WHEREAS, on December 31, 2014, the Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants filed a consolidated memorandum of law in support of the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss. *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, Adv. Pro. No. 08-01789 (SMB), ECF No. 8903;

WHEREAS, pursuant to further Scheduling Orders, on June 26, 2015, the Trustee filed (a) a consolidated memorandum of law in opposition to the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss, (b) a supplemental memorandum in opposition to the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss, and (c) either a proposed amended complaint or proffered allegations as to the Extraterritoriality Issue that the Trustee would include in a proposed amended complaint. *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, Adv. Pro. No. 08-01789 (SMB), ECF Nos. 8990, 9350, 9720;

WHEREAS, on September 30, 2015, the Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants filed (a) a consolidated reply memorandum of law in support of the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss and (b) defendant-specific supplemental reply memoranda in support of the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss. *See id.*

WHEREAS, on December 16, 2015, the Bankruptcy Court heard oral argument on the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss. *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, Adv. Pro. No. 08-01789 (SMB), ECF No. 12798;

WHEREAS, on November 22, 2016, the Bankruptcy Court issued a Memorandum Decision Regarding Claims to Recover Foreign Subsequent Transfers (the “Memorandum Decision”) that granted the Extraterritoriality Motion to Dismiss as to causes of action seeking to recover subsequent transfers the Bankruptcy Court ET Defendants received from Fairfield Sentry Limited, Fairfield Sigma Limited, Fairfield Lambda Limited, Kingate Global Fund Limited, Kingate Euro Fund Limited, and/or Harley International (Cayman) Limited (the “Foreign Registered Funds”) on grounds of international comity (the “International Comity Holding”). *See Securities Investor Prot. Corp. v. Bernard L. Madoff Inv. Sec. LLC*, Adv. Pro. No. 08-01789 (SMB), ECF No. 14495 at 36–40;

WHEREAS, the Trustee has also asserted subsequent transfer claims against the Joinder Defendants seeking to recover transfers they allegedly received from one or more of the Foreign Registered Funds;

WHEREAS, the Joinder Defendants are deemed to incorporate all the arguments set forth by similarly situated defendants in the District Court Extraterritoriality Motion and the consolidated Bankruptcy Court Extraterritoriality Motion;¹

WHEREAS, in light of the foregoing, the Parties hereby seek entry of this So Ordered Stipulation Applying the Memorandum Decision's International Comity Holding ("Stipulation"), to allow the Joinder Defendants listed in Exhibit A hereto to participate in any related appeal;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, AGREED, AND SO ORDERED, that:

- (1) as to claims seeking to recover subsequent transfers the Joinder Defendants allegedly received from the Foreign Registered Funds, pursuant to section 550(a) of the Bankruptcy Code, applicable provisions of SIPA including section 78fff-2(c)(3) and/or New York Debtor and Creditor Law, the Memorandum Decision's International Comity Holding applies equally to the Joinder Defendants in the adversary proceedings identified in Exhibit A hereto, substantially all of which are alleged domestic transferees who were "located" in the United States;²
- (2) the Parties are hereby directed to confer for the purpose of submitting consensual orders consistent with the dispositions of the Memorandum Decision's International Comity

¹ The Joinder Defendants do not join in any supplemental briefing submitted by individual defendants in the extraterritoriality briefing before the Bankruptcy Court.

² As noted on Exhibit A, Citigroup Global Markets Limited was incorporated as a limited liability company in England, with its registered office in London, United Kingdom. Additionally, Lighthouse Supercash Fund Limited was established pursuant to laws of British Virgin Islands, re-domiciled to the Cayman Islands in 2006, and managed in Florida by joinder defendant, Lighthouse Investment Partners LLC, d/b/a Lighthouse Partners.

Holding and this Stipulation in each of the adversary proceedings identified in Exhibit A.

If the Parties cannot submit consensual orders, they should settle orders on notice to the other parties in those adversary proceedings;

- (3) if the Memorandum Decision's International Comity Holding is reversed, the adversary proceedings are remanded, or the Bankruptcy Court's Memorandum Decision is otherwise overturned in any manner by appeal, the Parties fully preserve their rights to prosecute and defend the Trustee's subsequent transfer claims against the Joinder Defendants for transfers allegedly received from one or more of the Foreign Registered Funds on any other basis, and the period during the pendency of this appeal shall not be used by any party as a basis for arguing undue delay or untimeliness as to the exercise of any such right by the Trustee or the Joinder Defendants;
- (4) the Parties expressly reserve all rights and defenses with respect to any transfer not addressed by the Memorandum Decision's International Comity Holding; and
- (5) this Stipulation may be signed by the parties in any number of counterparts, each of which when so signed shall be an original, but all of which shall together constitute one and the same instrument. A signed facsimile, photostatic or electronic copy of this stipulation shall be deemed an original.

Dated: January 18, 2017
New York, New York

By: /s/ David J. Sheehan
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP
45 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, New York 10111
Telephone: (212) 589-4200
Facsimile: (212) 589-4201
David J. Sheehan
Email: dsheehan@bakerlaw.com

*Attorneys for Irving H. Picard, Trustee
for the Substantively Consolidated SIPA
Liquidation of Bernard L. Madoff Investment
Securities LLC and the Estate of Bernard L.
Madoff*

By: /s/ Mark G. Cunha
SIMPSON THACHER & BARTLETT LLP
425 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017-3954
Telephone: (212) 455-2000
Facsimile: (212) 455-2502
Mark G. Cunha
Email: mcunha@stblaw.com
Peter E. Kazanoff
Email: pkazanoff@stblaw.com
Jeffrey E. Baldwin
Email: jballdwin@stblaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Fairfield Greenwich
Advisors LLC, Fairfield International
Managers Inc., Mark McKeefry, Daniel Lipton,
Lourdes Barreneche, Cornelis Boele, Santiago
Reyes, Jacqueline Harary, Barreneche, Inc.,
Fairfield Greenwich Capital Partners, Fortuna
Asset Management, Inc., Selecta Financial
Corporation Inc., Charles Murphy, and Share
Management LLC*

By: /s/ Glenn M. Kurtz

WHITE & CASE LLP

1155 Avenue of the Americas

New York, NY 10036-2787

Telephone: (212) 819-8200

Facsimile: (212) 354-8113

Glenn M. Kurtz

Email: gkurtz@whitecase.com

Andrew W. Hammond

Email: ahammond@whitecase.com

Attorneys for Defendant Walter Noel

By: /s/ Daniel J. Fetterman

**KASOWITZ BENSON TORRES &
FRIEDMAN LLP**

1301 Avenue of the Americas

New York, NY 10019

Telephone: (212) 506-1700

Facsimile: (212) 506-1800

Daniel J. Fetterman

Email: dfetterman@kasowitz.com

Attorney for Defendant Jeffrey Tucker

By: /s/ Edward M. Spiro

**MORVILLO ABRAMOWITZ GRAND
IASON & ANELLO PC**

565 Fifth Avenue

New York, NY 10017

Telephone: (212) 856-9600

Facsimile: (212) 856-9494

Edward M. Spiro

Email: espiro@maglaw.com

Attorney for Defendant Robert Blum

By: /s/ Bruce A. Baird

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

1201 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20004-2401
Telephone: (202) 662-6000
Facsimile: (202) 662-6291
Bruce A. Baird
Email: bbaird@cov.com

Attorney for Defendant Gregory Bowes

By: /s/ Thomas J. Moloney

**CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN &
HAMILTON**

One Liberty Plaza
New York, New York 10006
Telephone: (212) 225-2000
Facsimile: (212) 225-3999
Thomas J. Moloney
Email: tmoloney@cgsh.com

Attorney for Defendant HSBC Bank USA, N.A.

By: /s/ Carmine D. Boccuzzi Jr.

**CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN &
HAMILTON LLP**

One Liberty Plaza
New York, New York 10006
Telephone: (212) 225-2000
Facsimile: (212) 225-3999
Carmine D. Boccuzzi, Jr.
Email: cboccuzzi@cgsh.com

*Attorney for Defendant Citigroup Global
Markets Limited*

By: /s/ Bruce M. Ginsberg

DAVIS & GILBERT LLP

1740 Broadway

New York, New York 10019

Telephone: (212) 468-4800

Facsimile: (212) 468-4888

Bruce M. Ginsberg

Email: bginsberg@dglaw.com

Joseph Cioffi

Email: jcioffi@dglaw.com

James R. Serritella

Email: jserritella@dglaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Natixis Financial
Products LLC (as successor in interest to
Natixis Financial Products Inc.)*

By: /s/ Michael Buttermann

DUANE MORRIS, LLP

1540 Broadway

New York, NY 10036

Telephone: (212) 692-1000

Facsimile: (212) 692-1020

Michael Buttermann, Esq.

Email: mdbuttermann@duanemorris.com

William Heuer, Esq.

Email: wheuer@duanemorris.com

Patricia Heer, Esq.

Email: PHHeer@duanemorris.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Delta National Bank
and Trust Company*

By: /s/ Heather L. Kafele

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP

401 9th Street, NW

Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 508-8000

Heather L. Kafele

Email: hkafele@shearman.com

Keith Palfin

Email: keith.palfin@shearman.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Naidot & Co. and
Banco Itaú Europa International, n/k/a Banco
Itaú International*

By: /s/ Eugene R. Licker

BALLARD SPAHR LLP

919 Third Avenue, 37th Floor

New York, NY 10022-3915

Telephone: (212)-223-0200

Facsimile: (212) 223-1942

Eugene R. Licker

Email: lickere@ballardspahr.com

*Attorney for Defendant Lighthouse Investment
Partners LLC, d/b/a Lighthouse Partners and
Lighthouse Supercash Fund Limited*

By: /s/ Daniel S. Shamah

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

Times Square Tower

7 Times Square

New York, NY 10036

Telephone: (212) 326-2138

Facsimile: (212) 326-2061

Daniel S. Shamah

Email: dshamah@omm.com

*Attorney for Defendant Credit Suisse Securities
(USA) LLC*

By: /s/ M. William Munno

SEWARD & KISSEL LLP

One Battery Park Plaza
New York, New York 10004
Telephone: (212) 574-1200
Facsimile: (212) 480-8421
M. William Munno
Email: munno@sewkis.com
Michael B. Weitman
Email: weitman@sewkis.com

*Attorneys for Arden Asset Management Inc.
and Arden Asset Management LLC*

By: /s/ Gregory F. Hauser

WUERSCH AND GERING LLP

100 Wall Street, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10005
Telephone: (212) 509-4713
Facsimile: (212) 509-9559
Gregory F. Hauser
Email: gregory.hauser@wg-law.com

*Attorney for Defendants Vontobel Asset
Management Inc.*

By: /s/ Mark T. Ciani

KATTEN MUCHIN ROSENMAN LLP

575 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10022-2585
Telephone: (212) 940-6509
Facsimile: (212) 940-8776
Mark T. Ciani
Email: mark.ciani@kattenlaw.com

*Attorney for Defendant Northern Trust
Corporation*

By: /s/ Hugh K. Murtagh

**CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN &
HAMILTON LLP**

One Liberty Plaza
New York NY 10006
Telephone: (212) 225-2116
Facsimile: (212) 225-3999
Hugh K. Murtagh
Email: hmurtagh@cgsh.com

*Attorney for Defendant Credit Agricole
Corporate and Investment Bank*

By: /s/ John F. Zulack

**FLEMMING ZULACK WILLIAMSON
ZAUDERER LLP**

One Liberty Plaza
New York, NY 10006
Telephone: (212) 412-9500
Facsimile: (212)964-9200
John F. Zulack
Email: jzulack@fzwz.com

*Attorney for Defendants Lyxor Asset
Management Inc., as general partner of SG
AM AI Premium Fund L.P. and SG AM AI
Premium Fund L.P.*

SO ORDERED.

Dated: January 18, 2017
New York, New York

/s/ STUART M. BERNSTEIN
HONORABLE STUART M. BERNSTEIN
UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY JUDGE